

# NEW HISTORY YORK

THE NEW YORK STATE  
HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION  
AND THE  
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—  
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

SPRING  
2014

**95/2**

# THE NEW YORK STATE HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

## OFFICERS

Douglas E. Evelyn  
CHAIRMAN

Thomas O. Putnam  
VICE CHAIRMAN

Richard C. Vanison  
TREASURER

Glenn A. Perrone  
SECRETARY

Stephen M. Duff  
ASSISTANT TREASURER

## NON-TRUSTEE OFFICERS AND SENIOR STAFF

Paul S. D'Ambrosio  
PRESIDENT AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

Joseph Siracusa  
VICE PRESIDENT FOR OPERATIONS

Barbara Fischer  
SENIOR DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Marnie Auld  
DIRECTOR OF FINANCE

Erin Richardson  
DIRECTOR OF COLLECTIONS

Michelle Murdock  
DIRECTOR OF EXHIBITIONS

Gretchen Sorin  
DIRECTOR OF THE COOPERSTOWN  
GRADUATE PROGRAM

Danielle Henrici  
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

Todd Kenyon  
DIRECTOR OF MARKETING

## BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Douglas E. Evelyn  
Kathleen Flanagan  
Nellie Gipson  
Shelley Graham  
Doris Fischer Malesardi  
Erna Morgan McReynolds  
Jeffrey H. Pressman  
Thomas O. Putnam  
John B. Stetson  
Ellen Tillapaugh  
Richard C. Vanison  
Craig Steven Wilder

## EX-OFFICIO

The Hon. Andrew M. Cuomo

## HONORARY TRUSTEE

Eugene V. Thaw

NOVEMBER 2014



# NEW YORK HISTORY

QUARTERLY JOURNAL OF  
THE NEW YORK STATE  
HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION  
AND THE  
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—  
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

COOPERSTOWN, NEW YORK

SPRING  
2014

95/2

## EDITORIAL BOARD

PAULA BAKER

STUART M. BLUMIN

PATRICIA U. BONOMI

EDWIN G. BURROWS

LESLIE E. FISHBEIN

TIMOTHY J. GILFOYLE

KENNETH T. JACKSON

LISA KELLER

TIMOTHY J. SHANNON

CRAIG S. WILDER

MICHELLE MURDOCK, ACTING DIRECTOR  
OF PUBLICATIONS

CAITLIN MIOSEK, PUBLICATIONS ASSISTANT

## EDITORS

F. Daniel Larkin, Ph.D.

Thomas D. Beal, Ph.D.

William S. Walker, Ph.D.

*New York History* (ISSN 0146-437x) is a peer reviewed journal published four times a year by the New York State Historical Association in partnership with State University of New York, College at Oneonta. Submitted articles should deal in an original fashion with the history of the state. Articles that deal with the history of other areas, or with general American history must have a bearing on New York State history. It is assumed that the article will have some new, previously unexploited material to offer or will present new insights or new interpretations. Suggested length is 4500 words.

We ask that authors submit articles electronically. Submissions as well as footnotes should be double-spaced. Provision and costs of images for articles are the responsibility of the author. *New York History* employs, with some modification, note forms suggested in the *Chicago Manual of Style*. Submissions can be sent directly to NYSHA's Publications Department [publications@nysha.org](mailto:publications@nysha.org)

The journal will process submissions as quickly as possible, but three to six months should be allowed for a thorough reading. *New York History* does not pay for author's articles.

## CONTENTS

- 151** | Editors' Introduction  
F. DANIEL LARKIN, THOMAS D. BEAL, WILLIAM S. WALKER
- 154** | "No Lawyer in the Assembly!":  
Character Politics and the Election of 1768 in New York City  
LUKE J. FEDER
- 172** | "To Lay Violent Hands":  
Prosecuting Sexual Violence in Colonial New York  
MATTHEW L. WILLIAMS
- 193** | Society of United Irishmen Revolutionary and New-York  
Manumission Society Lawyer:  
Thomas Addis Emmet and the Irish Contributions to the Antislavery  
Movement in New York  
CRAIG A. LANDY
- 223** | Remembering Alexander Hamilton:  
The Political Impact of Street Theatre in the Early Republic  
JOSEPH A. DWYER III
- 243** | Documents and Interpretations
- 243** | The Cooperstown Bible  
KENT P. JACKSON
- 271** | Book Review Essay
- 271** | Planned Landscapes and Leisure in Anglo-American Culture:  
A Critical Book Review Essay  
THOMAS A. CHAMBERS
- 279** | Book Reviews: New Books on New York
- 279** | Strong • *The Unkechaug Indians of Eastern Long Island: A History*  
REVIEWED BY MARSHA HAMILTON
- 281** | Krohn-Hansen • *Making New York Dominican: Small Business, Politics,  
and Everyday Life*  
REVIEWED BY LAUREN HAMMOND
- 284** | Johnson • *Arsenic and Clam Chowder: Murder in Gilded Age New York*  
REVIEWED BY JEFFREY A. JOHNSON

## CONTENTS

- 287** | Kohn • *Heir to the Empire City: New York and the Making of Theodore Roosevelt*  
REVIEWED BY TARA KATHLEEN KELLY
- 289** | Desjardins & Pharoux • *Castorland Journal: An Account of the Exploration and Settlement of Northern New York State by French Emigres in the Years 1793 to 1797*  
REVIEWED BY CHRISTOPHER LEAHY
- 292** | Hayes • *Slavery Before Race: Europeans, Africans, and Indians at Long Island's Sylvester Manor Plantation, 1651–1884*  
REVIEWED BY CHRISTOPHER J. MAUCERI
- 295** | Laughlin-Schultz • *The Tie That Bound Us: The Women of John Brown's Family and the Legacy of Radical Abolitionism*  
REVIEWED BY EVAN C. ROTHERA
- 297** | Rosenblum • *Habitats: Private Lives in the Big City*  
REVIEWED BY LYNN SALLY
- 299** | Holloway • *The Measure of Manhattan: The Tumultuous Career and Surprising Legacy of John Randell, Jr., Cartographer, Surveyor, Inventor*  
REVIEWED BY STEVEN CARL SMITH
- 304** | Gordon • *The Selected Papers of Elizabeth Cady Stanton & Susan B. Anthony, Volume VI: An Awful Hush, 1895–1906*  
REVIEWED BY SUSAN J. STANFIELD
- 306** | Weiner • *Power, Protests, and the Public Schools: Jewish and African American Struggles in New York City*  
REVIEWED BY JEFFREY WHEATLEY
- 309** | Exhibit Review
- 309** | Brooklyn Abolitionists / In Pursuit of Freedom  
WILLIAM S. WALKER

## Editors' Introduction

F. Daniel Larkin, Thomas D. Beal, and William S. Walker

**A**lthough *New York History* publishes essays covering the length and breadth of New York's history, the journal has long been known for high-quality scholarship on the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Path breaking essays on this critical period in New York's history by Carl Abbott, Carl Becker, David M. Ellis, Robert D. Ernst, Dixon Ryan Fox, Jean P. Jordan, Milton Klein, Michael Kammen, Richard B. Morris, Howard B. Rock, George Rogers Taylor, Gordon S. Wood, and Langdon G. Wright have appeared in the journal's pages.<sup>1</sup> With articles on eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century topics, this issue not only continues a tradition but also reflects our commitment to offer innovative ways of conceptualizing the study of the past. Readers will find essays on familiar historical figures, such as Philip Livingston, James DeLancey, Alexander Hamilton, or John Tabor Kempe, which challenge a traditional interpretation or explore heretofore overlooked archival evidence. From political maneuvering and violent crime in the eighteenth century to street theater and abolition in the nineteenth century, the essays in this issue remind us

---

1. Carl Abbot, "Neighborhoods of New York, 1760–1775," *New York History* 55 (January 1974): 35–54; Carl Becker, "John Jay and Peter Van Schaack," *New York History* 50 (October 1969): 1–12; David M. Ellis, "Assimilation of the Welsh in Central New York," *New York History* 53 (January 1972): 299–333; Robert D. Ernst, "Andrew Elliot, Forgotten Loyalist of Occupied New York," *New York History* 57 (July 1976): 285–320; Dixon Ryan Fox, "Minutes of the Presbytery of New York, 1775–1776," *New York History* 50 (October 1969): 22–43; Jean P. Jordan, "Women Merchants in Colonial New York," *New York History* 58 (October 1977): 412–439; Milton M. Klein, "John Jay and the Revolution" *New York History* 81 (January 2000): 19–30; Milton M. Klein, "Clio Ascendant: The Writing of American History in the Eighteenth Century," *New York History* 68 (January 1987): 4–26; Milton M. Klein, "From Community to Status: The Development of the Legal Profession in Colonial New York," *New York History* 60 (April 1979): 133–156; Michael Kammen, "The Rediscovery of New York's History, Phase One," *New York History* 60 (October 1979): 373–406; Richard B. Morris, "John Jay and the Adoption of the Federal Constitution in New York: A New Reading of Persons and Events," *New York History* 63 (April 1982): 133–164; Howard B. Rock, "The American Revolution and the Mechanics of New York City: One Generation Later," *New York History* 57 (July 1976): 367–394; George Rogers Taylor, "Gaslight Foster 'Journeyman Journalist' at Mid-Century," *New York History* 58 (July 1977): 297–312; Gordon S. Wood, "Evangelical America and Early Mormonism," *New York History* 61 (October 1980): 358–386; Langdon G. Wright, "In Search of Peace and Harmony: New-York Communities in the Seventeenth Century," *New York History* 61 (January 1980): 5–21.

that even the most heavily trod subjects can be reexamined productively, leading to new insights about New York's past.

The issue opens with Luke J. Feder's examination of the 1768 New York General Assembly election. Feder's study "No Lawyers in the Assembly" captures the dramatic and highly contentious electioneering that took place between the DeLancey and Livingston factions for the four open seats to represent New York City and New York County. While exploring eighteenth-century documents from attorney general John Tabor Kempe's career, Matthew L. Williams discovered notes and affidavits from a number of rape cases. In "To Lay Violent Hands," Williams uses these and other sources to examine the challenges Kempe and others faced when attempting to prosecute men suspected of sexually assaulting young girls and women. In "Society of United Irishmen Revolutionary and New-York Manumission Society Lawyer," Craig A. Landy brings to light the extraordinary life and accomplishments of Thomas Addis Emmet. Detailing Emmet's improbable rise in the legal profession and his contributions to the antislavery movement in New York, Landy provides a new perspective on those early-nineteenth-century men and women who made ending slavery and the slave trade their life's work. Attended by thousands and detailed in reports that appeared in newspapers across the United States, Alexander Hamilton's 1804 funeral is an overlooked yet historically significant moment in the Early Republic. In "Remembering Alexander Hamilton," Joseph A. Dwyer III is the first historian to provide an in-depth analysis of the cultural and political symbols, which the Society of the Cincinnati wove into every aspect of the procession. The funeral presented Federalists the opportunity, Dwyer argues, to transform Hamilton's image from that of an ideologically driven politician into an American hero who helped secure our nation's independence.

The issue offers readers probing examinations of primary documents, surveys of recent scholarship, and an overview of how one historical society is using material culture to highlight New York abolitionism. In Documents and Interpretations, Kent P. Jackson's "The Cooperstown Bible" details one of the long forgotten aspects of Cooperstown: its contribution to the history of American publishing. From a small, Main Street shop, Henry and Elihu Phinney published a popular and widely distributed edition of the Bible. New York's relationship to the Second



Great Awakening is well-known, but Jackson's essay encourages historians to consider expanding the movement's commercial links to the "market revolution." In the nineteenth century, residents of urbanizing areas, from Buffalo to New York City, witnessed the rise of parks and pleasure gardens. In a review essay "Planned Landscapes and Leisure in Anglo-American Culture," Thomas A. Chambers assesses two scholarly works on designed urban landscapes. Exploring subjects ranging from Theodore Roosevelt to Long Island's Unkechaug, *New Books on New York* provides critical assessments of eleven recently published volumes. Finally, in "Brooklyn Abolitionists / In Pursuit of Freedom," William S. Walker takes readers on a tour of the Brooklyn Historical Society's new exhibit on abolitionists and the anti-slavery movement in antebellum Brooklyn.

The production of *New York History* continues to be a group effort. The Editors have come to rely on the New York State Historical Association's librarians, archivists and professional staff. Our Interns and Research Assistants, Miles L. Jahnke, Irene Manoussos, Luke B. Murphy, and Andrew M. Solar made valuable contributions behind the scenes. As always, we thank those readers and subscribers who send words of encouragement and criticism; both are helping us expand the understanding of New York's history. If you have questions about the content of these pages, then please contact us by electronic mail at [publications@nysha.org](mailto:publications@nysha.org).