

NEW YORK HISTORY

FENIMORE ART MUSEUM
AND THE
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

SUMMER/
FALL
2017

98/3-4

FENIMORE ART MUSEUM

OFFICERS

Jeffrey H. Pressman
CHAIRMAN

Thomas O. Putnam
VICE CHAIRMAN

Richard C. Vanison
TREASURER

Alexander R. Charlton
SECRETARY

Stephen M. Duff
ASSISTANT TREASURER

NON-TRUSTEE OFFICERS AND SENIOR STAFF

Paul S. D'Ambrosio
PRESIDENT AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

Joseph Siracusa
VICE PRESIDENT FOR OPERATIONS

Barbara Fischer
SENIOR DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Erin Richardson
DIRECTOR OF COLLECTIONS

Danielle Henrici
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

Todd Kenyon
DIRECTOR OF MARKETING

Chris Rossi
DIRECTOR OF EXHIBITIONS

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Stephen M. Duff
Douglas E. Evelyn
Kathleen Flanagan
Nellie Gipson
Shelley Graham
Robert E. Hanft
Josef E. Jelinek
Charles B. Kieler
Erna Morgan McReynolds
Anne Older
Jeffrey Pressman
Thomas O. Putnam
Doris Fischer Malesardi
Ellen Tillapaugh
Richard C. Vanison

EX-OFFICIO

The Hon. Andrew M. Cuomo

HONORARY TRUSTEE
Eugene V. Thaw

FEBRUARY 2018

FENIMORE
ART MUSEUM

HISTORY

NEW YORK

QUARTERLY JOURNAL OF
FENIMORE ART MUSEUM
AND THE
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

COOPERSTOWN, NEW YORK

SUMMER/
FALL
2017

98/3-4

EDITORIAL BOARD

PAULA BAKER
STUART M. BLUMIN
PATRICIA U. BONOMI
LESLIE E. FISHBEIN
TIMOTHY J. GILFOYLE
KENNETH T. JACKSON
LISA KELLER
TIMOTHY J. SHANNON
ROBERT W. SNYDER
CRAIG S. WILDER

EDITORS

Thomas D. Beal
D.L. Noorlander
Susan Goodier

New York History (ISSN 0146-437x) is a peer reviewed journal published four times a year by Fenimore Art Museum in partnership with State University of New York, College at Oneonta. Submitted articles should deal in an original fashion with the history of the state. Articles that deal with the history of other areas, or with general American history must have a bearing on New York State history. It is assumed that the article will have some new, previously unexploited material to offer or will present new insights or new interpretations. Suggested length is 4500 words.

We ask that authors submit articles electronically. Submissions as well as footnotes should be double-spaced. Provision and costs of images for articles are the responsibility of the author. *New York History* employs, with some modification, note forms suggested in the *Chicago Manual of Style*. Submissions can be sent directly to Fenimore Art Museum Publications Department publications@fenimoreart.org

The journal will process submissions as quickly as possible, but three to six months should be allowed for a thorough reading. *New York History* does not pay for author's articles.

CONTENTS

- 315** | Introduction
SUSAN GOODIER, THOMAS D. BEAL, D.L. NOORLANDER
- 317** | “He May Sneer at the Course We Are Pursuing to Gain Justice”:
Lydia Sayer Hasbrouck, *The Sibyl*, and Corresponding about
Women’s Suffrage
LAURA J. PING
- 329** | Suffrage at the School House Door:
The 1880 New York State School Suffrage Campaign
GAYLYNN WELCH
- 343** | “The Merry War Goes On”:
Elite Suffrage in Gilded Age Manhattan
LAUREN C. SANTANGELO
- 367** | “Intruding in Sacred Territory”:
Forging Women’s Suffrage on the Buffalo-Niagara Frontier
SHANNON M. RISK
- 397** | More than a “Trophy for Womankind”:
Rabbi Stephen S. Wise and the Struggle for Suffrage in New York State
RANDI STORCH
- 422** | Who Voted for Woman Suffrage:
1915 & 1917 New York State Suffrage Referenda
RUSTY C. TOBIN
- 441** | Postcards and the New York Suffrage Movement
KENNETH FLOREY
- 465** | Crowdsourcing as a Tool for Studying the Woman
Suffrage Movement
THOMAS DUBLIN
- 475** | Historian’s Corner:
Seeking and Seeing Black Women:
Hester C. Jeffrey and Woman Suffrage Activism
SUSAN GOODIER

CONTENTS

489 | Book Review Essays:

489 | *The Spirit of New York: Defining Events in the Empire State's History*
REVIEWED BY PETER EISENSTADT

496 | *The Salome Ensemble: Rose Pastor Stokes, Anzia Yezierska, Sonya Levien, and Jetta Goudal and New York's Yiddish Theater: From the Bowery to Broadway*
REVIEWED BY TIMOTHY QUEVILLION

500 | Book Reviews: New Books on New York

500 | *Mobilizing New York: AIDS, Antipoverty, and Feminist Activism*
REVIEWED BY ARIELLA R. ROTRAMEL

503 | *Saratoga Springs: A Centennial History*
REVIEWED BY ELIZABETH REDKEY

506 | *Suffrage Reconstructed: Gender, Race, and Voting Rights in the Civil War Era*
REVIEWED BY JERRAD PACATTE

509 | *Alexander Rose, Men of War: The American Soldier in Combat at Bunker Hill, Gettysburg, and Iwo Jima*
REVIEWED BY LARRY GRANT

513 | *The Borscht Belt: Revisiting the Remains of America's Jewish Vacationland*
REVIEWED BY VICTORIA M. BRETING-GARCIA

517 | *Over a Barrel: The Rise and Fall of New York's Taylor Wine Company*
REVIEWED BY THOMAS RUMNEY

520 | *Empire of Cotton: A Global History*
REVIEWED BY FRANK W. GARMON, JR.

524 | Contributors

Editors' Introduction

Susan Goodier, Thomas D. Beal, D.L. Noorlander

Publishing an issue of the *New York History* journal in celebration of the centennial of women's right to vote in New York State seemed both appropriate and necessary. This issue is the product of nearly three years of work. All of the articles included here, representing the latest scholarship of nine historians, help tell the complicated story of the more than seven decades of commitment on the part of three generations of women to win the right to vote in New York State. But this is not just a New York State story. Once women won New York, they threw their considerable talents and energies into the national movement. These essays will continue to be meaningful as we move forward to the centennial of the federal amendment granting women the right to vote in the United States.

Within the general topic of woman suffrage, the topics explored in these essays vary widely. One group of articles included here focuses on the woman's suffrage movement in the nineteenth century. These include Laura Ping's article about the dynamic Lydia Sayer Hasbrouck, who refused to pay her taxes until she had the right to vote, Gaylynn Welch's article about the winning of the right to vote in school board elections in 1880, and Lauren Santangelo's article about elite suffragists in Gilded Age Manhattan. Four of the essays describe the early twentieth-century aspects of the story, inviting us to see the change over time as women moved closer to enfranchisement. Shannon Risk shifts our attention to suffrage activism in Buffalo and Niagara, while Randi Storch uses the outspoken commitment of Rabbi Stephen Wise to highlight the involvement of men in the movement. Rusty Tobin analyzes the differences between the two referenda held in 1915 and 1917, explaining why one succeeded and the other failed.

We include quite a few images in this issue. Ken Florey illustrates a fascinating aspect of the dominance of woman suffrage in his photo essay on the popularity of suffrage postcards. Thomas Dublin details an ongoing

data collection project involving the writing of biographies of nearly three thousand suffrage activists by hundreds of students (including about forty women's history students at SUNY Oneonta). Finally, Susan Goodier sheds light on the challenges of researching black women suffrage activists for our newest feature, the Historian's Corner. In the issues' book reviews we include topics that range from suffrage rights and social movement activism to vacationing and traveling in the state, from warfare to cotton and wine. Our review essay critiques two books on Jewish activism, creativity, and theater.

Writing and editing this issue has taken the efforts of a number of people. In addition to the anonymous peer reviewers, drawn from colleges and universities all over the country, and the steady work of the *New York History* journal's three editors, several SUNY Oneonta students assisted the process at various stages. Thomas Beal's students (Waldo A. Espinosa, Tierney E. Lynch, Meagan R. Moore, Sean Prahalis, Brittany E. Williams, Jennifer A. Yung), and Danny Noorlander's students (Chadwick Dunham, Evan Sanders, Mary Sawyer, Elia Tanzer, Dominique Wright) provided help and feedback during the editing process. Susan Goodier's students (Ronald Bartlett, Kara Dunderdale, Shivani Patel, Matthew Racanello, and Joshua Rosen) also assisted with the most recent book reviews. We are grateful for their thoughtful contributions.