

NEW YORK HISTORY

FENIMORE ART MUSEUM
AND THE
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

SPRING
2018

99/2

FENIMORE ART MUSEUM

OFFICERS

Jeffrey H. Pressman
CHAIRMAN

Thomas O. Putnam
VICE CHAIRMAN

Richard C. Vanison
TREASURER

Alexander R. Charlton
SECRETARY

Stephen M. Duff
ASSISTANT TREASURER

NON-TRUSTEE OFFICERS AND SENIOR STAFF

Paul S. D'Ambrosio
PRESIDENT AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

Joseph Siracusa
VICE PRESIDENT FOR OPERATIONS

Barbara Fischer
SENIOR DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Erin Richardson
DIRECTOR OF COLLECTIONS

Danielle Henrici
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION

Todd Kenyon
DIRECTOR OF MARKETING

Chris Rossi
DIRECTOR OF EXHIBITIONS

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Stephen M. Duff
Douglas E. Evelyn
Kathleen Flanagan
Nellie Gipson
Shelley Graham
Robert E. Hanft
Josef E. Jelinek
Charles B. Kieler
Erna Morgan McReynolds
Anne Older
Jeffrey Pressman
Thomas O. Putnam
Doris Fischer Malesardi
Ellen Tillapaugh
Richard C. Vanison

EX-OFFICIO

The Hon. Andrew M. Cuomo

HONORARY TRUSTEE
Eugene V. Thaw

OCTOBER 2018

FENIMORE
ART MUSEUM

HISTORY

NEW YORK

QUARTERLY JOURNAL OF
FENIMORE ART MUSEUM
AND THE
STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK—
COLLEGE AT ONEONTA

COOPERSTOWN, NEW YORK

SPRING
2018

99/2

EDITORIAL BOARD

PAULA BAKER
STUART M. BLUMIN
PATRICIA U. BONOMI
LESLIE E. FISHBEIN
TIMOTHY J. GILFOYLE
KENNETH T. JACKSON
LISA KELLER
TIMOTHY J. SHANNON
ROBERT W. SNYDER
CRAIG S. WILDER

EDITORS

Thomas D. Beal
D.L. Noorlander
Susan Goodier

New York History (ISSN 0146-437x) is a peer reviewed journal published four times a year by Fenimore Art Museum in partnership with State University of New York, College at Oneonta. Submitted articles should deal in an original fashion with the history of the state. Articles that deal with the history of other areas, or with general American history must have a bearing on New York State history. It is assumed that the article will have some new, previously unexploited material to offer or will present new insights or new interpretations. Suggested length is 4500 words.

We ask that authors submit articles electronically. Submissions as well as footnotes should be double-spaced. Provision and costs of images for articles are the responsibility of the author. *New York History* employs, with some modification, note forms suggested in the *Chicago Manual of Style*. Submissions can be sent directly to Fenimore Art Museum Publications Department publications@fenimoreart.org

The journal will process submissions as quickly as possible, but three to six months should be allowed for a thorough reading. *New York History* does not pay for author's articles.

CONTENTS

- 156** | Editors' Introduction
THOMAS D. BEAL, D.L. NOORLANDER, SUSAN GOODIER
- 158** | Religion, Wealth, and Geographic Location:
The Loyalists of Newburgh, New York
KIERAN J. O'KEEFE
- 183** | Teaching the Teachers:
Black Education in Nineteenth-Century New York City
SANDRA ROFF
- 196** | Reconstruction Era New York State Democrats:
Deserving the "Execration of History"
ALAN SINGER
- 209** | Historian's Corner:
"Tobacconist, Methodist, African, Patriot:
Uncovering the Real Peter Williams in Early Republic New York City"
KYLE T. BULTHUIS
- 227** | Book Reviews:
New Books On New York
- 227** | *Henry George and the Crisis of Inequality: Progress and Poverty in the Gilded Age.*
REVIEWED BY VICTORIA M. BRETING-GARCIA
- 232** | *Teach Me to Be Generous: The First Century of Regis High School in New York City.*
REVIEWED BY GIANCARLO MALCHIODI
- 235** | *Power on the Hudson: Storm King Mountain and the Emergence of
Modern American Environmentalism.*
REVIEWED BY DANIEL WAYNE RINN
- 239** | *The Public Universal Friend: Jemima Wilkinson and Religious Enthusiasm in
Revolutionary America.*
REVIEWED BY KYLE B. ROBERTS
- 242** | *Knickerbocker Commodore: The Life and Times of John Drake Sloat, 1781-1867.*
REVIEWED BY EVAN C. ROTHERA
- 245** | *Imagining New York City: Literature, Urbanism and the Visual Arts.*
REVIEWED BY TIM VERLAAN
- 248** | *Upstate Cauldron: Eccentric Spiritual Movements in Early New York State.*
REVIEWED BY JONATHAN W. WILSON
- 252** | Contributors

Editors' Introduction

Thomas D. Beal, D.L. Noorlander, Susan Goodier

More so than any other time of the year, late spring and summer make New Yorkers nostalgic. In these months, we may spend our free time hiking along mountaintops, walking along sandy beaches, swimming in lakes, or gawking at man-made landmarks, but the past is never far from our thoughts. This year, the Franklin D. Roosevelt Presidential Library and Museum gave our reflections on the bygone days of the early twentieth century a dramatic boost when it announced the opening of the LeHand Film Collection. The nine home movies, made by Missy LeHand, offer a window onto the semi-private world of Franklin D. and Eleanor Roosevelt. The films include scenes of the Roosevelts sailing, picnicking, walking, and socializing with friends, and playing with a family pet by a pool. But there are also clips of President Roosevelt before enormous crowds, carrying out the government's business. Collectively, the films remind us of the enormous challenges the man confronted and overcame. This summer, as the days lengthen, it is comforting to recall how one New York resident forever—and dramatically—transformed the offices he held and dominated the political era he lived through.¹

This issue of *New York History* continues to explore transformative moments in the state's past. We begin in the revolutionary era with Kieran O'Keefe's essay on the Loyalists of Newburgh, New York: "Religion, Wealth, and Geographic Location." O'Keefe examines the tensions among the residents of Newburgh from the 1760s through the 1780s, showing how their religious affiliations and material circumstances impacted their decisions about the war. The discussion of political conflict continues in Alan Singer's essay, "Reconstruction Era New York State Democrats." Drawing upon a wealth of political speeches and newspaper reports, Singer challenges readers to confront New York State's contributions to racial tension in the era of the American Civil War. In "Teaching the Teachers:

1. For more information on the LeHand Film collection see, <https://fdrlibrary.org/LeHand-Films>.

Black Education in Nineteenth Century New York City,” Sandra Roff explores how, begrudgingly and often tactlessly, the Board of Education staffed many public schools in the late nineteenth century.

The issue also includes a special Historian’s Corner essay by Kyle T. Bulthuis. It explores how historians have interpreted (and in some cases misinterpreted) the life, times, and contributions of Peter Williams—one of the most prominent African American residents of New York City during the early Republic. The issue also includes an eclectic collection of seven book reviews. We offer reviews of two recent biographies: one of Henry George that reminds us of his continuing influence on the theory and practice of political economy, the other on Commodore John Drake Stoa, whose little-known career illuminates our understanding of naval affairs from before the War of 1812 through the Civil War. Other reviewers examine books on the literary, visual, and material culture of New York City; the history of the Catholic Regis High School, also in New York City; and environmentalism as it relates to Storm King Mountain on the Hudson River. Finally, we include two reviews of books on spiritualism, including one on Jemima Wilkinson, the Universal Friend, and another on more eccentric spiritual movements in upstate New York.

Producing *New York History* has been and continues to be a privilege and challenge, and the editors cannot do it alone. Peer reviewers, colleagues, friends, hard-working and committed Research Assistants and our Research Assistant for Media Outreach Ms. Brittany Williams have made valuable contributions to the issue. We thank them and the journal’s readers. If you have questions or comments about the journal’s contents, we encourage you to contact us by electronic mail at publications@fenimoreart.org.